

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS
NEW YORK NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K GARRISON (1946-1991)
PANDOLPH E PAUL (1946-1956)
SIMON H RIFKIND (1950-1995)
LOUIS S WEISS (1927-1950)
JOHN F WHARTON (1927-1977)

UNIT 3601 OFFICE TOWER A BEIJING FORTUNE PLAZA
NO 7 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU
CHAOYANG DISTRICT
BEIJING 100020
PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF CHINA
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5826-6300

12TH FLOOR HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING
3A CHATER ROAD, CENTRAL
HONG KONG
TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE
10 NOBLE STREET
LONDON EC2V 7JU, U K
TELEPHONE (44-20) 7367 1600

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 373-3183

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(212) 492-0183

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

ratkins@paulweiss.com

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING
2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME
CHIYODA-KU TOKYO 100-0011 JAPAN
TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100
PO BOX 226
TORONTO ONTARIO M5K 1J3
TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

2001 K STREET NW
WASHINGTON DC 20006-1047
TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200
POST OFFICE BOX 32
WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032
TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

MATTHEW W ABBOTT
EDWARD T ACKERMAN
JACOB A ADLERSTEIN
ALLAN J ARFFA
ROBERT A ATKINS
DAVID J BALL
SCOTT A BARSHAY
JOHN F BAUGHMAN
J STEVEN BAUGHMAN
LYNN B BAYARD
CRAIG A BENSON
MITCHELL L BERG
MARK S BERGMAN
DAVID M BERNICK
JOSEPH J BIAL
BRUCE BINGBOIM
H CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING
ANGELO BONVINO
JAMES L BROCHIN
DAVID W BROWN
SUSANNA M BUERGEL
PATRICK S CAMPBELL*
JESSICA S CAREY
JEANETTE K CHAN
GEOFFREY R CHEPIGA
ELLEN N CHING
WILLIAM A CLAREMAN
LEWIS R CLAYTON
JAY COHEN
KELLEY A CORNISH
CHRISTOPHER J CUMMINGS
CHARLES E DAVIDOW
THOMAS V DE LA BASTIDE III
ARIEL J DECKELBAUM
ALICE BELISLE EATON
ANDREW J EHRLICH
GREGORY A EZRING
LESLIE GORDON FAGEN
ROSS A FIELDSTON
BRAD J FINKELSTEIN
BRIAN P FINNEGAN
ROBERTO PINZI
PETER E FISCH
ROBERT C FLEDER
MARTIN FLUMENBAUM
ANDREW J FOLEY
ANDREW J FORMAN*
HARRIS B FREIDUS
MANUEL S FREY
ANDREW L GAINES
KENNETH A GALLO
MICHAEL E GERTZMAN
ADAM M GIVERTZ
SALVATORE GOGLIORIELLA
NEIL GOLDMAN
ROBERTO J GONZALEZ*
CATHERINE GOODALL
ERIC GOODISON
CHARLES H GOOGE JR
ANDREW G GORDON
UDI GROFMAN
NICHOLAS GROOMBRIDGE
BRUCE A GUTENPLAN
ALAN S HALPERIN
JUSTIN G HAMILL
CLAUDIA HAMMERMAN
BRIAN S HERMANN
MICHELE HIRSHMAN
MICHAEL S HONG
DAVID S HUNTINGTON
AMRAN HUSSEIN
LORETTA A IPPOLITO
JAREN JANGHORBANI
BRIAN M JANSON
JEH C JOHNSON
MEREDITH J KANE

JONATHAN S KANTER
BRAD S KARP
PATRICK N KARSNITZ
JOHN C KENNEDY
BRIAN KIM
DAVID M KLEIN
ALAN W KORNBERG
DANIEL J KRAMER
DAVID K LAKHDHIF
STEPHEN P LAMB*
JOHN E LANGE
GREGORY F LAUFER
BRIAN C LAVIN
XIAOYU GREG LIU
JEFFREY D MARELL
MARCO V MASOTTI
EDWIN S MAYNARD
DAVID W MAYO
ELIZABETH R MCCOLM
ALVARO MEMBRILLERA
MARK F MENDELSON
CLAUDINE MEREDITH-GOUJON
WILLIAM B MICHAEL
JUDIE NG SHORTELL*
CATHERINE NYARADY
JANE B O'BRIEN
ALEX YOUNG K OH
BRAD R OKUN
KELLEY D PARKER
VALERIE E RADWANER
CARL L REISNER
LORIN L REISNER
WALTER G RICCIARDI
WALTER RIEMAN
RICHARD A ROSEN
ANDREW N ROSENBERG
JACQUELINE P RUBIN
CHARLES F RICK RULE
RAPHAEL M RUSSO
ELIZABETH M SACKSTEDER
JEFFREY D SAFERSTEIN
JEFFREY B SAMUELS
DALE M SARRO
TERRY E SCHIMEK
KENNETH M SCHNEIDER
ROBERT B SCHUMER
JOHN M SCOTT
STEPHEN J SHIMSHAK
DAVID R SICULAR
MOSES SILVERMAN
STEVEN SIMKIN
JOSEPH J SIMONS
AUDRA J SOLOWAY
SCOTT M SONTAG
TARUN M STEWART
ERIC ALAN STONE
AIDAN SYNNOTT
RICHARD C TARLOWE
MONICA K THURMOND
DANIEL J TOAL
LIZA M VELAZQUEZ
LAWRENCE G WEE
THEODORE V WELLS JR
STEVEN J WILLIAMS
LAWRENCE I WITDORCHIC
MARK B WLAZLO
JULIA MASON WOOD
JENNIFER H WU
BETTY YAP*
JORDAN E YARETT
KAYE N YOSHINO
TONG YU
TRACEY A ZACCONE
TAURIE M ZEITZER
T ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI JR

*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR

August 18, 2017

By ECF

The Honorable Cathy Seibel
United States District Judge
The Honorable Charles L. Brieant Jr.
Federal Building and United States Courthouse
300 Quarropas Street
White Plains, NY 10601-4150

International Business Machines Corporation v. Jeff S. Smith, No. 17 Civ. 5808

Dear Judge Seibel:

We represent Plaintiff International Business Machines Corporation ("IBM"). This letter is submitted on behalf of both IBM and, with the consent of his counsel, Defendant Jeff Smith, in response to the question from Chambers as to whether the parties would consent to consolidating the preliminary injunction hearing with trial on the merits pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 65(a)(2). After carefully considering this issue, the parties respectfully do not consent to consolidation. We can provide additional information as to the basis for that decision at the Court's request.

In addition, in anticipation of Monday's hearing, the parties respectfully request that the Court permit each side brief opening statements of no more than ten minutes.

Honorable Cathy Seibel

2

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Robert Atkins". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Robert A. Atkins

cc (by ECF): Counsel of Record